DR JOHN L GAUCI

& ASSOCIATES

In the Public Contracts Review Board Notre Dame Ditch Floriana



Today, the 25th March 2024

Reasoned Objection to Tender Award Decision Ref: CT 2192/2023

Reference: Framework Agreement for the Disposal of Asbestos Containing Material in an Environmentally Friendly Manner from Malta for the Water Services Corporation

Reasoned objection of M Stream Limited (TID 199735) ('Objector') Respectfully submits:

By means of the present, Objector is lodging a formal objection against the tender award decision dated 15th March 2024 regarding the above-referenced tender (CT 2192/2023) ('the Tender') in terms of the Public Procurement Regulations.

The Objector's grievances consist inter alia of the following:

1. Technical Compliance Misinterpretation

The decision letter states, "The EO was asked to rectify missing literature regarding the Training Certificates requested for Environmental Technicians in asbestos removal. The EO submitted a declaration instead of the requested certificates. (Specifications Clause 4.3)."

Contrary to this, the tender document clearly specifies under point (C): "Declaration that the Registered Environmental Technicians for asbestos removal shall be trained for asbestos removal and registered with the OHSA, and that the training certificates... will be submitted to the Contracting Authority at the assignment of each Job Order."

The Objector adhered precisely to these instructions by submitting the required declaration, in strict conformity with the tender's stipulated submission process.

The decision misinterpreted these guidelines, unjustifiably marking the Objector as non-compliant. Thus the appealed decision should be overturned and Objector reinstated in the Tender process.

ADVOCATE

2. Ethical and Conflict of Interest Concerns

The award decision recommends Edile First Choice Zerafa (TID 199662), while revealing that offers were also submitted by Barbagallo First Choice Zerafa.

This raises substantial ethical issues, leading to a potential conflict of interest, as these entities appear to be related. Such instances of conflict of interest go contrary to basic principles of public procurement legislation and applicable General Rules Governing Tenders. Furthermore such a situation breaches the fundamental procurement principles of fairness and integrity.

In view of the above considerations and other submissions and evidence that will be presented during the hearing of this present Objection, the Objector respectfully demands:

- 1. Immediate disqualification of Edile First Choice Zerafa due to ethical violations and conflict of interest concerns.
- 2. Immediate disqualification of Barbagallo First Choice Zerafa for the same ethical and conflict of interest reasons.
- 3. Reinstatement of the Objector in the tender procedure.
- 4. Without prejudice to the above demands and alternatively, that this Board orders a complete and unbiased reevaluation of all tenders by a newly constituted evaluation board, instructed to exclude any bidder failing to comply with ethical standards or found in a conflict of interest.
- 5. A full refund of the deposit paid by the Objector for lodging this formal objection.

Dr. John L. Gauci LL.D

DIPARTIMENT TAL-KUNTRATTI Notre Dame Ravelin Floriana FRN 1601 – MALTA



DEPARTMENT OF CONTRACTS Notre Dame Ravelin Floriana FRN 1601 - MALTA

Contact Number:

+356 2378 1001

e-Mail: info.contracts@gov.mt

website: www.contracts.gov.mt

15th March 2024

M-Stream Ltd TID 199735

REFERENCE:

CT 2192/2023

SUBJECT:

Framework Agreement for the Disposal of Asbestos Containing

Material In An Environmentally Friendly Manner From Malta for the

Water Services Corporation

Dear Sir/Madam.

Thank you for participating in the above-mentioned tender procedure. However, I regret to inform you that the offer submitted by your company was found to be technically non-compliant as follows:

"The EO was asked to rectify missing literature regarding the Training Certificates requested for Environmental Technicians in asbestos removal. The EO submitted a declaration instead of the requested certificates. (Tech Specs Clause 4.3)"

The tender was recommended for award to TID 199662 Edile First Choice Zerafa for the amount of €1,545,525.00 excluding VAT, this being the cheapest priced tender satisfying the administrative and technical criteria.

If you intend to object to this decision, the Public Procurement Regulations allow for an official objection which in this case has to be lodged electronically with the Public Contracts Review Board by sending an email on: <u>info.pcrb@gov.mt</u> by noon of Monday 25th March 2024 against a deposit of €10,017.00.

Payments are to be made through bank transfer in terms of the following details:

Name of Account Holder	Cashier Malta Government
Name of Bank	Central Bank of Malta
Address of Bank	Castille Place, Valletta
Account Number	40001EUR-CMG5-001-H
BIC	MALT MT MT
IBAN Code	MT55MALT011000040001EURCMG5001H
Bank Code	01100

DIPARTIMENT TAL-KUNTRATTI Notre Dame Ravelin Floriana FRN 1601 - MALTA



DEPARTMENT OF CONTRACTS Notre Dame Ravelin Floriana FRN 1601 - MALTA

Contact Number: +356 2378 1001

e-Mail: <u>info.contracts@gov.mt</u> website: <u>www.contracts.gov.mt</u>

The official schedule can be accessed on the website: www.etenders.gov.mt.

Although we have not been able to make use of your services on this occasion, I trust that you will continue to take an active interest in our initiatives.

Yours sincerely,

Joseph Anthony Zammit

f/ Director General (Contracts)

♦ HSB C | Priority Payment

You have authorised this payment

The status for payment 37806UD01VG9 is: Received by bank

Payment summary - Priority Payment

M-STREAM LIMITED

MT MTHBMTCA043-022425-001 EUR

Pay to

Amount

Cashier Malta Government

MT MT55MALT011000040001EURCMG5001H EUR

EUR 10,017.00

Expected value date

Mon 25 Mar 2024

This is the date we expect to debit your account.

Please ensure that the debit account has enough funds to cover the payment.

37806UD01VG9

Priority Payment

Instruction reference number

Transaction type

Your reference

MST CT 2192/2023

Beneficiary bank location

Malta

Beneficiary bank identifier

SWIFT-BIC MALTMTMT

Beneficiary bank

CENTRAL BANK OF MALTA

CASTILLE PLACE VALLETTA MALTA

Charges

Share